

#### ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, page no. 62-73

To cite this article: Atuwene Peter, Athumani A. Kyaruzi and James A Nyangas (2024). ASSESSING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF EMPLOYABLE LEARNING PATHWAYS IN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN VETA LINDI AND MTWARA CENTERS, International Journal of Education and Social Science Research (IJESSR) 7 (5): 62-73 Article No. 973, Sub Id 1524

## ASSESSING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF EMPLOYABLE LEARNING PATHWAYS IN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN VETA LINDI AND MTWARA CENTERS

Atuwene Peter<sup>1</sup>, Athumani A. Kyaruzi<sup>2</sup> and James A Nyangas<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Sokoine Sokoine University of Agriculture, P.o.box.3038 Morogoro-Tanzania. University of Agriculture,

<sup>2</sup>School Sokoine University of Agriculture, P.o.box.3000 Morogoro-Tanzania.

<sup>3</sup>Sokoine University of Agriculture, P.o.box.3038 Morogoro-Tanzania. Corresponding Author: Atuwene Peter

DOI: https://doi.org/10.37500/IJESSR.2024.7506

### ABSTRACT

This study assessed the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in Vocational Education and Training (VET) in two Vocational Education and Training Authority (VETA) centres; Lindi and Mtwara in Tanzania. VET plays a crucial role in youth employment, but there are challenges in ensuring that graduates' skills align with market demands. The study employed a survey research design and gathered data from 123 respondents, including 116 trainees and seven instructors, through closed questionnaires. The study was guided by human capital theory. Data were analyzed using SPSS version 26. Descriptive statistics and chi-square tests were employed to assess the effectiveness of the curriculum in teaching methods and learning resources at those centres, as well as to evaluate resource availability. Findings revealed that work-based learning particularly industrial attachments positively impacts skills development, but language barriers and inadequate resources hinder effectiveness. The study recommends that improving infrastructure in vocational institutes and resource compatibility with industry standards can better equip students for the job market, thus reducing youth unemployment in Tanzania.

KEYWORDS: Employability, learning pathways, Skills, Vocational Education and Training.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Vocational education stands as a form of training that prepares individuals for skilled roles as an artisan or a technician (VETA, 2019). It equips individuals with the necessary skills to be employed



Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

for profit or to work independently (Gunawan, 2022). Vocational Education and Training (VET) plays a crucial role in facilitating youth employment, but it is essential to understand the different phases of acquiring vocational skills. Recent information has indicated that graduate unemployment is more challenging worldwide, becoming a significant concern (Gewer, 2021; ILO, 2019). Following the impact of globalization on job skills requirements by employers and how it is shaping their companies' competitiveness. Employers are now more focused on securing the greatest talents (Offor and Nanighe, 2014).

Work-based learning is one of the most important VET strategies many times it involves multiple pathways where learners learn both in class and practice simultaneously at a real job site putting into use professional practical skills. The classroom is usually a typical VET methodology where students learn in a concentrated environment like theoretical training, lectures and discussions before they move to practical training (Özer, 2022). Students engaged in VET training are ready to work on their own or as part of a team upon completion (Luhala & Zhang, 2021).

Vocational education and training approaches vary between developed and developing countries. China has the world's most extensive system, enrolling over 22 million secondary and post-secondary vocational education students (Yuan & Wang, 2021). Germany's dual-learning approach combines classroom instruction with hands-on experience and apprenticeships (Bibb, 2016). Tanzania among developing countries, in Sub-Saharan Africa has limited practical approaches to formal Vocational Education and Training (VET) programs (Alemu, 2023). This limitation is influenced by insufficient resources, resulting in low-quality and inadequate practical training (NACTE, 2020). This inadequate practical training appears as a significant shortcoming in some VET programs, as it hinders the development of real-world skills (Gewer, 2021). The East African Community has a high unemployment rate, but vocational training can help youth achieve productive and long-lasting employment by connecting their skills to the market demand. (Guàrdia et al., 2021).

After independence, vocational education was established in the country to address a shortage of skilled labour. This operation also involved existing trade schools such as Ifunda and Moshi Technical School which were handed over during the colonial period (Munishi, 2016). They provided three-year training courses that equipped people with the skills and practical experience needed for different trades and workshop practices, meeting the nation's need for a qualified workforce. Mokoro (2023) Advised that involving youth in vocational training is crucial to lowering unemployment and transitioning from knowledge-based to competency-based educational systems.

Currently, Tanzania has over 79 vocational training centres, including Lindi and Mtwara, which offer long-term and short-term occupational courses tailored to specific skills such as mechanical, civil, electrical, hospitality, and design and sewing (URT, 2020a). The goal is to assist students in acquiring the knowledge and skills required for a particular profession. With this strategy, learning outcomes could be improved, labour market demands could be met, and youth unemployment may be decreased



Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

for the benefit of the community (OECD & ILO, 2014; URT, 2019; VETA, 2019). This study, aimed to assess the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocational education and training. It examined how these pathways, including work-based and classroom-based learning, contribute to equipping students with relevant skills and improving their employment prospects. By evaluating these pathways, this research provides insights into how VET can be enhanced to meet labour market needs better and reduce youth unemployment in Tanzania.

## 1.1 Rationale of the Study

Tanzania is among the countries suffering from graduate unemployment (Mtebe et al., 2020). Tanzania's government implemented Vocational Education and Training (VET) to lower youth unemployment, which offers training focused on certain occupations. Despite these efforts, the highest number of unemployed comes from VET trainees due to inadequate employable skills required in the present labour market (Salum & Munishi, 2016). The findings were similar to the study done by (Mgaya, 2022) In vocational education and training (VET), students face many challenges in developing employability skills due to inadequate training facilities. Employers reveal dissatisfied with the skills of young VETA graduates (Mihyo, 2020). Consequently, this study examined the effectiveness of employable learning pathways for Mechanic trade in VETA Lindi and Mtwara centres.

## **1.2 Theoretical Framework**

The human capital theory guided this study. According to human capital theory by Coleman (2017), education levels significantly influence job choices in a competitive labour market. Employers want to maximize earnings and increase output by hiring workers with the necessary skills. Vocational education is essential for human capital and provides learners with industry and job-specific skills that increase their employability. People can work for businesses or use their newly acquired skills for self-employment, which suggests that investments in education and training enhance individuals' skills and knowledge, thus increasing their productivity and employability (Kailo, 2020). By applying this theory, the study evaluates how well the learning pathways in VET centres prepare students for the labour market, finally assessing their impact on students' employability and economic outcomes. encourages individual economic growth and contributes to better national economic conditions.

## 2. METHODOLOGY

This study was conducted at two Regional Vocational Training and Service Centers (RVTSC) in Lindi and Mtwara. Due to the nature of the area, (emerging of gas, existence of dry port, Dangote cement industry) mechanic trade is important for curriculums which guide them to be designed with adaptation flexibility and awareness of future labour market needs (NACTE, 2020). The study employed a survey research design, The survey research approach "provides a quantitative or numerical description of trends, attitudes, or opinions of a population by studying a sample of that population". This method effectively generalizing findings from a sample to a larger population, making it appropriate for large-scale studies (Creswell J. W and Creswell, 2023). A questionnaire was used to collect data and the data were collected through closed-ended questionnaires administered to continuing trainees and instructors



### ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

to assess the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocational education and training at specified centres. The study employed purposive sampling to select trainees and instructors in the mechanic trade, Purposive sampling is the participant's purposeful choice based on their characteristics (Almalki, 2016), resulting in a total of 123 respondents from the centres, of which 116 were trainees and seven were instructors. Data were collected, coded and entered into SPSS 26 for analysis. The observed results were compared to the expected results such that a chi-square test was performed using a significance level of p < 0.05 with frequency, mean and standard deviation calculated for descriptive statistics to evaluate whether VET learning pathways overall operated as envisioned in practices.

### **3.0 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 3.1 Demographic information**

Main Category	Sub-Category	Frequency	<b>Proportions (%)</b>
Respondents	Lindi	63	51
	Mtwara	60	49
Sex	Male	111	90
	Female	12	10
Age	18 - 24	112	91
	25 - 30	05	04
	31 - 40	05	04
	41 - 50	01	01
Education Qualification	Level I	22	18
	Level II	71	56
	Level III	23	19
	CTE	02	2
	DTE	01	1
	Bachelor Degree	03	2
	Master Degree	01	1

### Table 1. Demographic information of respondents (n=123)



#### ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

Students' fields / Courses	MVM	72	62
	WF	44	38
Time courses undertaken	Long course	104	90
	Short course	12	10

Source: Research data 2024

### Number of Respondents per Institute/region

Table 1 shows a minor difference in the number of respondents from Lindi 63(51.2%) and Mtwara 60(48.8%) VET college. The study also revealed the number of students to be higher in Lindi due to its adequate accommodation places compared to Mtwara (VETA, 2019) supports these findings, emphasizing the importance of preparing a conducive environment for good learning outcomes.

### Sex of respondents

The data in Table 1 shows that the VET institutions in the study areas were more occupied by males (90.2%) compared to their counterparts (females) who were (9.8%). The difference between males and females was associated with masculine perceptions of VETA programs that; male characters might fit Mechanical trades like welding, motor vehicle mechanics (Twita, 2014). The findings were contrary to the 2014 educational policy which promotes equal access to education regardless of gender, ethnicity/religion, and physical disabilities (URT, 2020b).

## Age of respondents

Table 1 illustrates that most respondents in the study were in the 18-24 age group, comprising (91%) of the total respondents, which aligns with the majority of vocational education enrolled were in the active age group (4%) respondents followed this in the 25-30 and 31-40 age groups and (2%) in the 41-50 age group.

## The education level of respondents

The respondents in this study had varying levels of education, including different levels for trainees and trainers. The trainees' education levels were categorized into Level I, II, and III, while the trainers had qualifications ranging from a Certificate of Technical Education (CTE) to a Master's degree. The data presented in Table 1 indicates that 22 respondents (17.8%) were at Level I, 71 respondents (57.7%) were at Level II, and 23 respondents (18.6%) were at Level III. Among the trainers, 2 (1%) held a CTE, 1 (1%) had a Diploma in Technical Education (DTE), 3 (2%) had a Bachelor's degree, and 1 (1%) had a Master's degree.

#### Learning courses

The respondents' trainees were asked about their preferences in learning courses. Whether they took a long or short course in their studies in which trade. Table 1 shows that a significant majority of



#### ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

respondents (62.1%) undertook the motor vehicle mechanics (MVM) course while (37.9%) of respondents took the welding and fabrication (WF) course. Many joined long courses (between 1 to 3 years) to acquire adequate skills and knowledge in their respective courses to suit the marketing demand.

## **3.2 Effectiveness of employable learning pathways**

Respondents were provided with various statements on both teaching techniques and learning resource factors related to the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocation and training at VETA from the study area. Their choices made on a five (5) Likert scale were of utmost importance, with 1=Strongly Disagree to make a completely ineffective factor, 2=Disagree, 3= neither agree nor disagree, 4=Agree and 5=Strongly Agree to create a factor to be more effective in influencing employable learning pathways in VETA. The respondents had to choose from the list of questions in the table. During the data presentation and analysis, strongly agree and agree were termed Agree presented by the letter 'A,' neither nor was termed as neutral 'N,' Strongly Disagree and Disagree were termed 'D'. The table shows the P-value ( $X^2$ ) under the suggestion that the low value or equal to (0.000 - 0.05) will be accepted.

Indicators for employable learning pathways	Α		Ν		D		<b>P-Value</b>
	f	%	f	%	f	%	(X <sup>2</sup> )
Effectiveness of VET work-based instructional method.							
The work-based method is most effective in helping VET students develop skills for employability	77	62.6	10	8.1	36	29.3	0.24
The language of instruction used is a challenge in teaching and learning	83	67.3	16	13	24	19.5	0.001*
Students are well-informed on what is needed in the job market	21	27.1	20	16. 3	82	66.7	0.087
Internships concentrate on helping VET students develop skills for employability	86	69.9	15	12. 2	22	17.9	0.056
Students attend industrial attachment and are well-assessed	82	58.3	20	8.9	21	22.8	0.027*

#### Table 2: Effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocational education and training



#### ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

Career guidance and counselling are provided after choosing a course of study	98	79.7	09	7.3	16	13	0.065
Written and spoken communication will help in job findings	22	17.9	15	12. 2	86	69.9	0.46
Effectiveness in learning resources							
Training facilities are not compatible with those used in the industry	91	74	13	10. 6	19	15.4	0.026*
The workshop used has modern and well-functional equipment	06	4.9	14	11. 4	10 3	83.7	0.01 <i>5</i> *
The resources for teaching and learning are insufficient	79	64.2	06	4.9	38	30.9	0.019*
Students do not gain all required industrial skills while learning	84	68.3	18	14. 6	21	17.1	0.086

## Significant at 0.05

### Source: Research Data, 2024

Table 2 shows that the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocational education and training is divided into teaching techniques and learning resources.

**3.2.1 Effectiveness of VET Work-based instructional method for Employable learning pathways** The work-based method instructional method is the most used in Tanzania VET centres, some indicators show whether the work-based method is implemented effectively to promote employability. The results showed these indicators and relied on the level of agreement and disagreement of students and instructors in those indicators to judge the effectiveness of the method in promoting employability.

The language of instruction emerged as a challenge with students' comprehension of the language being vital for effectively communicating the subject matter. The observed frequencies in the responses varied significantly from the expected distribution ( $P \le 0.001$ ). A considerable 67.3% of respondents agreed that the language of instruction, mainly English, presents a challenge during teaching. This highlights the significant role of language barriers in hindering learning, especially in a predominantly Swahili-speaking context. Knowledge acquisition and dissemination methods significantly influence academic success and understanding of theory and practice. The emphasis on language is particularly relevant in VET institutions, which aim to prepare individuals for global market competitiveness, where English is the common language.



Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

The language makes them less engaged because it sometimes leads to ineffective listening/understanding of the instructions implemented in fieldwork, as also seen by Mgaya (2022). It took much work for VET learners who spoke Swahili to adjust to the English language. Consequently, dissatisfied trainees signed a challenging labour market for VETA graduates due to limited job opportunities over an extended period. These findings align with a study by Mtebe et al. (2020) which thoroughly examined graduate employment in Tanzania and suggested that the country contends with graduate unemployment.

Another indicator of an effective work-based method to enhance the employable pathway was to require students to attend industrial attachment practices and assess their performance. The observed distribution of responses revealed a statistically significant difference from the expected distribution ( $P \le 0.027$ ). Over half (58.3%) of the respondents agreed to be engaged in industrial attachments and being assessed effectively. Industrial attachments aim to make students use the learned theories in a working environment before entering another academic year. OECD and ILO, (2014) believed a smoother transition from education to the workforce can be facilitated for young people by providing them with high-quality internships. High unemployment results from a mismatch between the skills provided by the vocational education institution and the demands of the industry, which could be attributed to low participation in internships (Wahjono & Kristianto, 2023). It is contrary to vocational education's original goal of reducing the unemployment rate. Cooperation between industry and vocational education is one way to address the issue. Hence, trainees and trainers had better attend industrial attachment.

## 3.2.2 Learning resources for employable learning pathways

Learning resources are any tools, or materials, used by both teachers and students that can help facilitate and support learning. The collected data reveals that 74% of the respondents agreed that the teaching and learning resources are not incompatible with the equipment used in industries and thus were inadequate for practical training. The p-value of 0.026 being statistically significant indicates a strong agreement with the statement. The institutes experienced insufficient teaching and learning facilities compatible with modern industrial tools. Offor and Nanighe (2014) found unsatisfactory material resources in Nigerian secondary schools for effective teaching of technical and vocational education, while Bano et al. (2022) criticized the trend of a lack of skilled teachers and materials in skill-based subjects. Vocational education aims to develop skilled workers for self-reliance and economic development. Therefore, workshops must have appropriate tools, machines, and competent teachers.

Another indicator was the use of outdated equipment to train students who need to compete in the modern market. The observed responses revealed a statistically significant variation ( $p \le 0.015$ ) and a high level of agreement of about 83.7% to the statement. The study found that outdated equipment in workshops hindered effective curriculum coverage. According to Bano et al. (2022) and Richard, (2018), many VET colleges require improved infrastructure and learning quality. The significance of VET to industry is reduced when mismatched with industry. Both instructors and students lack the

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

technological and methodological skills of today. Therefore, colleges need to be equipped with modern and well-functional tools that could fit the industrial needs/current global market for effective employable learning pathways.

The resources for teaching and learning were insufficient as agreed by a substantial proportion of respondents (64.2%). The p-value of 0.019 for the statement indicates statistical significance showing that the high agreement is not due to random chance. This showed that VET centres suffer from insufficient learning resources which might slow down the imparting of necessary skills to students for employability. These results support research done by Offor and Nanighe (2014) and Mgaya (2022) felt that; to achieve the desired results, combine theory and practice effectively. If there was insufficient equipment in workshops the subjects taught in technical and vocational education are skill-based and call for real-world experience. The situation might lead to inadequate skills among VET students that match the industrial needs. Consequently, the number of competent graduates produced falls short of the expectations of the job market. As such, attention must be directed towards the quality of TVET expansion rather than quantity.

## 4.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study concludes that on the effectiveness of employable learning pathways in vocational education and training (VET), Lindi and Mtwara centres provide practical skills that meet the demands of market needs for graduates. In line with human capital theory, which emphasizes obtaining skills and knowledge that are adaptable to the current competitive global market. Based on the data collected, the study concludes that; language of instructions, industrial attachment, training facilities, workshops and teaching resources were important factors influencing the effectiveness of VET learning pathways. The study highlighted the importance of aligning VET training with industry needs and ensuring that students receive comprehensive, practical training to enhance their employability.

Based on these findings, The VETA Directorate of Training should implement additional language support programs to help students overcome the challenges of the English language.

The Ministry of Education Science and Technology in collaboration with VETA should increase resource allocation to VET centres to ensure the availability of necessary teaching and learning materials and modernize training equipment in workshops to ensure students receive comprehensive, practical training to enhance their employability.

Policymakers and curriculum developers enhance VET programs to align with market demand. Also, VETA should apply the dual Apprenticeship training system which aims to bridge the gap between training centres and workplaces by ensuring apprentices' skills align with industry requirements. This system encourages skill formation, solves youth unemployment, and improves soft skills and productivity. It also supports potential employees through company culture and work ethics.

## 4.0 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY



Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

The study focused on two courses at two vocational education and training Mtwara and Lindi (VET) institutions: Motor Vehicle Mechanics and Welding and Metal Fabrication. In total, 116 trainees and 7 trainers completed a closed-ended questionnaire. While the findings have relevance to a wide range of situations, it is important to note that generalizing the results could be dangerous due to the small sample size. Future studies should focus on longitudinal research to determine the employment outcomes of VET graduates over time with other trades.

## REFERENCES

- Alemu, F. M. (2023). Ramifications of Sectors Economic Upsurge on Rate of Early aged Unemployment in Case of East African Countries. 1–13.
- Almalki, S. (2016). Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Data in Mixed Methods Research— Challenges and Benefits. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 5(3), 288. https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v5n3p288
- Bano, N., Yang, S., & Alam, E. (2022). Emerging challenges in Technical Vocation Education and Training of Pakistan in the context of CPEC. *Economies* 10, 10(7), 1–16. https://doi.org/10.3390/economies10070153
- Coleman, T. S.(2017). Human Capital. 1-5. https://harris.uchicago.edu/files/humancapital\_1.pdf
- Creswell J. W and Creswell, J. D. (2023). *RESEARCH DESIGN: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (Sixth Edit).
- Gewer, A. (2021). Formal and Informal VET in Sub-Saharan Africa: Overview, Perspectives and the Role of Dual VET. https://shorturl.at/IRXZ0
- Guàrdia, L., Mancini, F., Jacobetty, P., & Maina, M. (2021). Graduates 'employability skills in East Africa. *The Journal of Teaching and Learning for Graduate Employability*, *12*(2), 169–184. https://ojs.deakin.edu.au/index.php/jtlge/%0AGraduates'
- Gunawan. (2022). Global Employment Trends for Youth 2022: Investing in transforming futures for young people. https://shorturl.at/glozG
- ILO (2019). State of Skills Tanzania. http://www.unicef.org/sowc2011/
- Kailo, M. (2020). Institutional Factors And The Acquisition Of Employable Skills Among Students In Technical, Vocational Education And Training Institutions In Kilifi County, Kenya [University of Nairobi]. http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke/handle/11295/153714
- Luhala, P. P., & Zhang, Y. (2021). Contribution of technical and vocational education training towards industrial development in Tanzania. *North American Academic Research (NAAR) Journal*, 4(5), 118–136. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4773947



Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

- Mgaya, S. (2022). Challenges facing learners' acquisition of employability competencies under competency-based education and training approach in Vocational education and training centres in Tanzania. *AJASSS*, *4*(2), 121–147. https://shorturl.at/oKMY6
- Mokoro, D. K. (2023). Attitudes of Youth-Trainees towards Technical, Vocational Education and Training in VETA Institutions in Arusha City, Tanzania. 9(4), 1–20.
- Mtebe, J., Kissaka, M. M., Raphael, C., & Stephen, J. K. (2020). Promoting Youth Employment through Information and Communication Technologies in Vocational Education in Tanzania. *Journal of Learning for Development*, 7(1), 90–107. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.56059/jl4d.v7i1.339
- Munishi. E. (2016). Factors contributing to lack of employable skills among technical and vocational education (tvet) graduates in Tanzania. I(2), 1–19.
- NACTE (2020). Mapping Skills Gap And Skills Needs For Technician Graduates In The Selected Economic Sectors For Industrial Growth In Tanzania.
- OECD, & ILO (2014). Promoting Better Labour Market Outcomes for Youth. *Report on Youth Employment and Apprenticeships Prepared for the G20 Labour and Employment Ministerial Meeting*, *August*, 27. https://www.oecd.org/g20/topics/employment-and-social-policy/OECD-ILO-Youth-Apprenticeships-G20.pdf
- Offor .I, & Nanighe.M. (2014). Availability of resources in technical and vocational education for economic development in secondary schools in South-South Nigeria. *The Intuition*, 6(1), 1–15. https://shorturl.at/DEH17
- Paschal B. Mihyo, D. E. M. J. B. M. (2020). Transition From School To Work -VETA a case study.
- Richard, T. (2018). Identification of the Skills Gap for Innovation and Success. 19.
- Twita, N. (2014). Role Of Vet: The Contribution Of Vocational Education To Youth Employment: A Case Study Of Veta And Non-Veta Graduates In Morogoro Region.
- URT (2018). Education Sector Development Plan (2016/17 2020/21) Tanzania Mainland (Issue 2017).
- URT (2019). The Vocational Education and Training Act. https://shorturl.at/yABY2
- URT (2020). Education sector development plan (2016/17 2020/21) Tanzania mainland.
- VETA (2019). *Tracer Study Report for 2010-2015 Vocational Education and Training Graduates*. https://shorturl.at/ykQK7
- Wahjono, H. G. B., & Kristianto, V. A. (2023). The Comparison of the Partnership model between



ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 7, Issue.5, Sep-Oct 2024, p no. 62-73

vocational education institutions and industrial sectors in North American and Indonesian universities. *Proceedings of the 4th Vocational Education International Conference (VEIC 2022)*, 198–210. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-47-3

 Yuan, W., & Wang, Y. (2021). The Development of Vocational Education and Training in China. *Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Education: Current Issues and Digital Technologies* (*ICECIDT* 2021), 555(Icecidt), 375–383. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210527.064