ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

THE PERCEPTION OF MUSLIM CONSUMERS IN PURCHASING COSMETICS WITHOUT HALAL LABEL

Afifah Tri Hyuanawati, Wisnu Untoro

Faculty of Economics and Business, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

As Muslim consumers dominates the population in Central Java, Indonesia, there are potential market for cosmetics industry. However, not all cosmetics has halal label that convince Indonesian Muslim to choose their products. This research aims to estimate a number of possibilities for Muslim to choose cosmetics without halal label. There are 150 Muslim respondents who join this research by answering a questionnaire related to attitude, perceived behavioral control, social norm, and purchase intention which is calculated later by using SmartPLS 2.0. The results prove that Muslim to wear cosmetics without halal label based on the variables proposed in this research and perceived behavioral control becomes the most significant influence towards purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label. Therefore, cosmetics company should put the quality first before halal label to gain more attention of Muslim consumers.

KEYWORDS: purchase intention, attitude, perceived behavioral control, social norm, Muslim consumers

INTRODUCTION

In Central Java, based on BPS data, there are 15.568.183 people from 16.091.112 of total population choose Islam as their religion. This means that 96,75% of population in Central Java are Muslim. Since the number of Muslim populations are so large, halal products become familiar in daily life. It cannot be denied that Islamic way of life becomes a habit in Central Java, including in choosing halal products. The halal concept is the most important protocol in Islamic countries (Haque, Sarwar, Yasmin, Tarofder & Hossain, 2015). It becomes part of a belief system and moral code of conduct of Muslim consumers that related to every single part of Islamic life (Baker, 2011). Islamic values give potential for building ethical brand since halal products consider animal welfare, health, sustainability, less waste, fair working conditions (Ismaeel & Blaim, 2012). Furthermore, halal products support healthy lifestyle which emphasize on animal-free products. Though a product needs animal parts, the animals should be treated in religious manner based on halal rules which offers hygienic and purified way (Abdullah, 2007). A product with halal label means it is safe for Muslim to consume. However, the role of purchasing in the halal products becomes interesting to study because it is still poorly understood (Tieman & Ghazali, 2013).

Though halal concept is related to Muslim society in specific (Alam & Sayuti, 2011), there is a large potential to magnify the interest of non-Muslim towards halal products. The halal label makes Muslim consumers sure that the product is safe according to Islamic requirements. Among 760

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

cosmetics companies in Indonesia, Wardah became the first brand in the cosmetics industry to produce halal products for female consumer who wears hijab as target market (Briliana & Mursito, 2017). It has halal label on its packaging which convince people that its products are safe for Muslim to wear. Meanwhile, Wardah also has two other makeup lines: Make Over and Emina. Make Over is one of cosmetic lines under PT. Paragon Technology and Innovation which also produces Wardah. Its packaging is dominated by black colour so that it looks elegant with affordable price and professional quality. In addition, compared to other local brands, Make Over offers more various product and colour choices. There are many beauty enthusiasts and makeup artists who recommend Make Over through their Instagram account (Megaputri, 2014). In the same company, Emina is a local cosmetic line and also the sister brand of Wardah and Make Over. Its target market is teenagers who just start to wear makeup. Its packaging is more girly than Wardah or Make Over and also affordable for teenagers (Kristia, 2018). Although Majelis Ulama Indonesia has certified Make Over and Emina as halal products, it does not put halal label on it.

This research is a replication of a study which was previously conducted by Haque, Sarwar, Yasmin, Tarofder, and Hossain (2015) about halal products. However, the researcher changes the respondents into Muslim to examine their perception towards unlabeled halal cosmetics. There are three independent variables in this research: attitude of Muslim, perceived behavioral control, and subjective norm, while purchase intention will be the dependent variable. Furthermore, this research will involve Make Over and Emina as halal beauty products that do not put any halal label on its packaging.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Purchase Intention

The relation between marketing and purchasing is unbreakable. Both have solid bond that influence each other. As the main goal of marketing, purchasing decision process has five stages, that is need recognition, information search, evaluation of alternatives, purchase decision, and post purchase behavior (Kotler & Keller, 2007). Before reaching those stages, a buyer needs to meet his purchase intention. Shah, Aziz, Jaffari, Waris, Ejaz, Fatima, and Sherazi (2012) define purchase intention as a reason for a buyer to purchase a particular brand by making a decision. The reasons and decision can be influenced by a number of factors that exist around the buyer.

There are some factors that influence the purchase intention. Several organizations even observe their consumers by giving questionnaire about the amount, way, and reason of purchasing a product. The observation results that purchase intention depends on culture, social, demography, and psychology (Kotler et al, 2007). Besides, Mukhtar & Butt (2012) propose that Theory of Reasoned Action can predict someone's choice of halal products. Meanwhile, Lada et al (2009) state that attitude and intention to purchase halal products have positive relationship.

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Attitude

An attitude, in consumer behavior, is a tendency to behave in a consistent favorable or unfavorable way to respect a given object. Here, the attitude can be based on object, are a learned predisposition, have consistency, and occur within a situation (Schiffman, Kanuk & Wisenblit, 2010). The attitude of consumer toward an object or product can be different. A consumer can accept a product as the way it is. On the other side, he or she can deny a product for a particular reason.

A Muslim, for example, should follow a certain protocol to avoid any kind of things that are considered as haram (Haque et al, 2015). It becomes one of the reasons why a Muslim need a halal label: to differentiate between allowed and forbidden objects in an easy way. However, though most Muslims show favorable attitude toward halal product, they may never buy a halal product yet. The factors that influence this attitude can be various both from internal or external. For instance, Halal cosmetic products only has limited number of studies (Mukhtar et al, 2012) so that those studies have not identify certain variables that affects the attitude of consumer towards halal cosmetics. Meanwhile, not all cosmetics are easily identified as halal. Some of them even do not have any halal label on their packaging. Thus, according to the statements above, the first hypothesis is proposed: H1: Attitude of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label.

Perceived Behavioral Control

A perceived behavioral control (PBC) is a perception of a person before controlled behavior by measuring difficulty of the behavior itself. It can be a predictor of intention alongside attitude and subjective norm (Ajzen & Madden, 1986). PBC tends to drive consumer's behavior when they have strong intention toward an object. When the intention is influenced by many factors, such as safety, cleanliness, price, and label, there will be consumer's behavior. The characteristics of consumer itself also determine the behavior toward an object, like skills, resources, etc. (Wilson & Grant, 2013). A written report in Jakarta Post article by Mufti (2018) claims that halal label recently has gained popularity in the world. The halal label gives a new perception of product quality. Since a product with halal label is guaranteed as safe based on Islamic law, it gains more popularity in its sale. However, for some products, quality is not solely defined by label. Cosmetics, for instance, do not always have halal label on it but Muslims still look for it because of other factors like quality, hygiene, price, etc. As this perceived behavioral control phenomenon, the second hypothesis is proposed:

H2: Perceived behavioral control of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label.

Subjective Norm

The subjective norm can be defined as individual's thought about believing that certain behavior can be accepted by related groups, such as the expectation of friends, peers, and family members (Lada

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

& Amin, 2009). As one of predictor of intention, subjective norm is related to social pressure in order to perform a behavior (Ajzen, 1991). Ajzen (2007) also defines subjective norm as the motivation of a person to follow a perspective and behavior of other people around them. Meanwhile, he or she has a right to decide whether to follow or ignore the perspective or behavior. Subjective norm which comes from the surrounding people has role, whether it is significant or not, to influence someone in making decision, especially how to behave. As a believe, Islam has spread certain subjective norm for Muslim. One of the Islamic norms is consuming halal product. Since many Muslims use similar cosmetics as non-Muslims', some of them may pay attention to the halal certificate as a part of obeying the Islamic norms. However, the people around Muslims are not also Muslims. The subjective norm also takes place in their behavior. Hereby, the third hypothesis is proposed as following:

H3: Subjective norm of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label

Theoretical Framework

Perceived
Behavioral
Control

Subjective
Norm

Picture 1. Theoretical framework (Haque et al, 2015).

RESEARCH METHOD

Data Collection

As the number of cosmetics users in Indonesia cannot be merely measured accurately, this research uses purposive sampling technique. The samples were taken by the intention of this research that is the people who wears cosmetics without halal label (Make Over and/or Emina products). Moreover,

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

this research focus on the Muslim consumer that the questionnaire contains religion choices to make sure that the respondents are Muslim. The samples take 150 respondents throughout Central Java, Indonesia. Each respondent needed to fulfill a questionnaire that was prepared and was distributed through e-mail. The respondents only need about 10 to 15 minutes to complete the questionnaire and the submit it through e-mail. This research uses SmartPLS 2.0 to process the data.

Respondents

There were 230 questionnaires that were distributed, 178 that came back to the researcher, and only 150 that is used in this research. Table 1 presents the demographic condition of the respondents. There are 144 of female and 6 of male respondents. The range of the respondent's age is divided into 4 categories as shown in Table 1. Based on age range, most respondents are students (102 of 150 respondents), either high school or college. The respondent's education shows that 66 of them got bachelor degree, 54 have high school degree, 15 respondents are master and 12 are diploma, also 3 of the respondents only got elementary education.

The next criteria of respondents involve occupation and income. There are 5 types of occupation that are determined in this research. They are civil servants (17), employee (25), entrepreneur (8), student (79), and others (21). Meanwhile, the income rate only divided into 3 categories: less than Rp 1.000.000 (44), between Rp 1.000.000 to Rp 3.000.000 (56), and more than Rp 3.000.000 (50).

Table 1. Demographic condition of respondents.

Criteria	Group	Frequency	Percentage
Gender	Male	6	4%
	Female	144	96%
Age	16-25	102	68%
	26-35	44	29.33%
	36-45	3	2%
	> 45	1	0.67%
Education	Elementary	3	2%
	High School	54	36%
	Diploma	12	8%
	Bachelor (S1)	66	44%
	Master (S2)	15	10%
Occupation	Civil servant	17	11.33%
	Employee	25	16.67%
	Entrepreneur	8	5.33%
	Student	79	52.67%
	Others	21	14%
Income (Rp)	< 1.000.000	44	29.33%

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

1	.000.000 - 3.000.000	56	37.33%
>	3.000.000	50	33.33%

Variables

There are four variables in this research. The independent variables consist of attitude, perceived behavioral control, and social norm. Meanwhile, purchase intention becomes the dependent variable that is affected by the three independent variables. Each variable that is involved in this research contains total of 19 indicators.

The first independent variable is attitude. Here, the variable of attitude focused on the response of the respondents towards cosmetics without halal label in their daily life. The sample question of this variable is "I feel comfortable to wear cosmetics without halal label." Then, the second independent variable, perceived behavioral control, involves the perception of respondents towards cosmetics without halal label. This perception can be influenced by external factors, such as people, advertisements, or news. The sample question is "I read many things about halal products in newspaper or online articles."

Subjective norm becomes the third independent variable. This variable concerns about the impacts of wearing cosmetics without halal label on respondents' daily life. The sample question for this variable is "This cosmetic gives positive effects for my health though it does not have halal label." The last but not least, there is purchase intention as the only dependent variable of this research. This variable learns the aim of the respondents to purchase the product. Its sample question is "I am sure that this cosmetic has safe guarantee though it does not have halal label." All of the items in the questionnaire were taken from Haque et al (2015).

RESULT ANALYSIS

Validity Test

Smart PLS 2.0 provides outer loading to measure the validity of each item in the questionnaire. When the outer loading score of an item is more than 0.7, it is considered as a valid item. Table 2 presents the validity of each item. However, six of the items are considered invalid since the score is less than 0.7. The invalid items in the table has been marked with an asterisk. Then, they will be removed for the next calculation.

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Table 2. Validity Test

Variable	Indicator	Outer Loading
Attitude	AT1	-0.573371*
	AT2	0.876746
	AT3	0.908313
	AT4	0.849558
	AT5	0.561015*
Perceived behavioral control	PBC1	0.868995
	PBC2	0.738034
	PBC3	0.375194*
	PBC4	0.486121*
	PBC5	0.814426
Subjective norm	SN1	0.529956*
	SN2	0.830300
	SN3	0.902610
	SN4	0.822833
	SN5	-0.364121*
Purchase intention	PI1	0.887041
	PI2	0.928715
	PI3	0.919574
	PI4	0.931255

Reliability Test

Table 3 presents that the composite reliability of the items is more than 0.8. This score reveals that the constructs are reliable. Moreover, there is Cronbach's alpha score which strengthen the reliability of the constructs. There are six internal consistency of Cronbach's alpha. They are excellent $(0.9 \le \alpha)$, good $(0.8 \le \alpha < 0.9)$, acceptable $(0.7 \le \alpha < 0.8)$, questionable $(0.6 \le \alpha < 0.7)$, poor $(0.5 \le \alpha < 0.6)$, and unacceptable $(\alpha < 0.5)$. Based on the score of Cronbach's alpha in this research shown in Table 3, the result is considered as acceptable to good. The lowest score is on subjective norm variable with 0. 778836 and it is considered as acceptable for reliability test. Based on the result, the data is reliable because displays consistent response of the respondents towards the questionnaire items.

Table 3. Reliability Test.

Variable	Cronbach's	Composite	Average Variance	R
	Alpha	Reliability	Extracted (AVE)	Square
Attitude	0.836948	0.900428	0.750917	
Perceived behavioral				
control	0.800270	0.881064	0.712450	
Subjective norm	0.778836	0.871601	0.693767	

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Purchase intention	0.909967	0.936984	0.788306	0.801213

Measurement of Fit Model

As proposed by Tennenhaus, Chatelin, Lauro, and Vinzy (2005), model test in Partial Least Square (PLS) can be measured by using its Goodness of Fit (GoF). Beside reliability, Table 3 also display the source of GoF score. The cut off score in GoF is divided into three categories: big (0.36), mid (0.25), and small (0.1). For this research, the GoF = \times = 0.6875322617. Since the GoF score is more than 0.36, this research model is included in big category and considered as good.

Hypotheses

The bootstrapping process in SmartPLS 2.0 helps this research to reveal the significant relation among the variables. A hypothesis is considered as accepted if the original sample is positive and the T-Statistic score is more than or equals to 1.96. When the hypotheses meet those terms, the relation among variables is positive and significantly influence each other.

 Original Sample (O)
 T Statistics (|O/STDEV|)
 Result

 AT → PI
 0.241892
 3.138656
 H_1 Accepted

 PBC → PI
 0.543037
 6.186331
 H_2 Accepted

 SN → PI
 0.191981
 2.418673
 H_3 Accepted

Table 4. Path coefficients.

Table 4 proves the relation between independent variables and dependent variable. As the T Statistics for AT (Attitude) and PI (Purchase Intention) is more than 1.96 (3.138656), their relation is significant. The original sample score shows positive result, that is 0.241892 which means that the relation between AT and PI is positive. The result determines that H1 is accepted.

The relation positivity between PBC (Perceived Behavioral Control) and PI (Purchase Intention) can be checked through the positive original sample, which is 0.543037. Meanwhile, the T statistics shares significant result as its score for PBC and PI relation is 6.186331 (>1.96). Therefore, based on the result, H2 is accepted.

The last hypothesis involves the relation of SN (Social Norm) and PI (Purchase Intention). Similar to previous results, the score of original samples for this relation shows a positivity (0.191981). Furthermore, the significance of SN and PI relation is confirmed by the fulfilled T statistics criteria, 2.418673, which is more than 1.96. As a result, the H3 is also accepted.

DISCUSSION

Generally, the responses of the respondents in this research show that halal label in cosmetics is often ignored by Muslim. The attitude variable shows that the respondents choose the product

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

because of other factors but the halal label. The factors can be product quality, price, convenience, hygiene, or environmental effects. Though choosing halal cosmetics become a good idea, the respondents seem not paying attention to the halal label. They are satisfied with the cosmetics as the whole thing, ignoring the halal quality of the product. Moreover, the respondents feel comfortable in wearing cosmetics without halal label because they are already convenient with the product. This becomes the reason of the first hypothesis, attitude of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label, is supported.

As explained in previous section, perceived behavioral control is a perception of a person before taking an action of controlled behavior. The consideration of the behavior will define the decision that will be made. The perception of cosmetic quality, for instance, is not defined by halal label. The respondents certainly have compared between the cosmetics with halal label and without halal label. They look at the quality, not the halal label. This means that they feel convenient with the cosmetics even though it does not have halal label. The people around the respondents do not judge them about the halal label on cosmetic packaging. It reveals that halal label does not become any matter for the respondents. Furthermore, they also search for information about halal products through online articles to convince them in making decision. This defines that the second hypothesis, perceived behavioral control of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label, is accepted.

A subjective norm plays an important role in considering a product. Quality usually becomes the first consideration. Most respondents declare that people around them choose cosmetics without seeing the halal label. Besides, they influence the respondents directly or indirectly to wear similar cosmetics. The respondents add that though the cosmetics does not have halal label, it does not give bad effect for health. They also convinced that the ingredients of the cosmetics are safe even though it does not have halal label. Thus, the third hypothesis, subjective norm of Muslims has positive and significant relation with purchase intention of cosmetics without halal label, is supported.

The last but not least, the only dependent variable—purchase intention—defines the trust of the respondents toward cosmetics without halal label. Since there are three other variables—attitude, perceived behavioral control, and subjective norm—that are considered before suggesting the purchase intention, the Muslim respondents, which is 100% Muslim, are convinced to choose cosmetics without seeing whether it has halal label or not. They focus on the safe process in making the cosmetics by checking the ingredients. People's opinion and testimony as a part of social norm also become a consideration for the respondents in gaining purchase intention. Therefore, purchase intention significantly has positive relation with attitude, perceived behavioral control, and subjective norm of a Muslim in choosing cosmetics without halal label.

CONCLUSION

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Unlike food, marketing activity in Indonesia for cosmetics is not merely between halal and non-halal. This research reveals that there is only little or no need for Muslim to check on the halal label of cosmetics. Emina and Make Over, as one of local product with high sales level, choose to not put halal label on their packaging. This could be their strategy to gain more market share. Although Indonesia is dominated by Muslims, there are also other adherents of other religions which are interested in wearing cosmetics. Both cosmetic brands need to care about consumer's preference. Emina and Make Over see this religion diversity as an opportunity to show their existence as national products with no barriers, unlike their sister brand, Wardah, that focus on Muslim consumer only. Different orientation that was defined by PT. Paragon Technology and Innovation has divided their cosmetics into three groups: Wardah for Muslims, Emina for teenagers, and Make Over for premium consumers. This division will ease the personnel to focus on their target market. However, though the cosmetics used in this research does not put halal label, they have registered their product to MUI and certified as halal product. Emina and Make Over keep their safe process and follow the rules to provide halal products, like using halal ingredients, do not harm people and animals, and obeying the Islamic protocol. Innovation is also needed to improve the sales growth in order to keep their existence.

Attitude, perceived behavioral control, and subjective norms need to be learned more by PT. Paragon and Innovation or other cosmetics companies. Since those three variables have significant influence in purchase intention, they need more attention so that the company can improve their products and gain more market share. Moreover, the collaboration between Wardah, Emina, and Make Over will convince consumers that they are not only safe but also halal for Muslim to wear even though Emina and Make Over do not put halal label on their package. As a result, the sales growth of those three brands will increase.

In addition, the importance of halal label still too low for Muslim consumers in Indonesia, especially Central Java. Their attitude, perception, and social norm still supports that Muslim consumers do not really care about halal label. Nevertheless, several cosmetics without halal label are actually have been registered in MUI as halal cosmetics. Therefore, there is no need for cosmetics company to delay the launch of their products only because they do not have halal label yet. However, they should put their product quality first in order to gain market share of Muslim consumers while attempt to get halal certificate from MUI.

REFERENCES

Abdullah, A.N. (2007), Perception and Awareness among Food Manufactures. Kuala Lumpur: Universiti Putra Malaysia Press.

Ajzen, Icek and Thomas J. Madden. (1986), Prediction of goal-directed behavior: Attitudes, intentions and perceived behavioral control, Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, Vol. 22, pp. 453-474.

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Ajzen, Icek. (1991), The theory of planned behavior. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, Vol. 50 No. 2, pp. 179-211.

Ajzen, Icek. (2007), Understanding Attitudes and Predicting Social Behavior. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Alam, Syed Shah and Nazura Mohamed Sayuti. (2011), Applying the Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) in halal food purchasing. International Journal of Commerce and Management, Vol. 21 No. 1, 8-20.

Badan Pusat Statistik. Population by Religion, Sex and Regency/City Results of The 2010

Population Census. Retrieved February 7, 2019 from

https://jateng.bps.go.id/statictable/2015/02/09/791/penduduk-menurut-agama-jenis-kelamin-dan-kabupaten-kota-hasil-sensus-penduduk-tahun-2010.

Baker, Ahmad Alserhan. (2011), The Principles of Islamic Marketing. Surrey: Gower Publishing Limited.

Briliana, Vita and Nurwanti Mursito. (2017), Exploring antecedents and consequences of Indonesian Muslim youths' attitude towards halal cosmetic products: A case study in Jakarta. Asia Pacific Management Review, Vol. 22, pp. 176-184

Haque, Ahasanul, Abdullan Sarwar, Farzana Yasmin, Arun Kumar Tarofder, and Mirza Ahsanul Hossain. (2015), Non-Muslim consumers' perception toward purchasing halal food products in Malaysia. Journal of Islamic Marketing, Vol. 6 No. 1, pp. 133-147.

Ismaeel, M. and Blaim, K. (2012), Toward applied Islamic business ethics: responsible halal business. Journal of Management Development, Vol. 31 No. 10, pp. 1090-1100.

Kotler, Philip and Kevin Lane Keller. (2007), Marketing Management. New Delhi: Prentice-Hall.

Kristia, Andira. (2018), Selain Wardah, Kelima Brand Kosmetik Lokal Ini Ternyata Juga Sudah Bersertifikat Halal, Lho! Retrieved February 7, 2019 from https://journal.sociolla.com/beauty/brand-kosmetik-lokal-halal/.

Lada, S., & Amin, H. (2009), Predicting intention to choose halal products using theory of reasoned action. International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management, Vol. 2 No. 1, pp. 66-76.

Majelis Ulama Indonesia. (2019), Daftar Belanja Produk Halal. Retrieved February 7, 2019 from http://www.halalmui.org/mui14/images/daftarprodukhalal.pdf.

Megaputri, Ghina Aulia. (2014), Make Over Brand Review. Retrieved February 7, 2019 from http://www.colored-canvas.com/2014/11/make-up-haul-make-over-brand-review.

Mufti, Riza Roidila. (2018), Non-food products tap into huge Muslim market in halal boom. Retrieved February 7, 2019 from https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2018/05/27/non-food-products-tap-into-huge-muslim-market-in-halal-boom-1527421126.html.

Mukhtar, Arshia and Muhammad Mohsin Butt. (2012), Intention to choose halal products: The role of religiosity. Journal of Islamic Marketing, Vol. 3 No. 2, pp. 108-120.

Schiffman, Leon G., Leslie Lazar Kanuk, and Joseph Wisenblit. (2010), Consumer Behavior Tenth Edition. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

ISSN 2581-5148

Vol. 2, No. 04; 2019

Shah, H., Aziz, A., Jaffari, A. R. Waris, S., Ejaz, W., Fatima, M. and Sherazi., K. (2012), The Impact of Brands on Consumer Purchase Intentions. Asian Journal of Business Management Vol. 4 No. 2, pp. 105-110.

Tennenhaus, M., Y. M. Chatelin, C. Lauro, dan V. E. Vinzy. (2005), PLS Path Modeling. Computational Statistics and Data Analysis. Vol. 48 No. 1, pp. 159-205.

Tieman, Marco and Maznah Che Ghazali. (2013), Principles in halal purchasing. Journal of Islamic Marketing, Vol. 4 No. 3, pp. 281 – 293.